

To the Accreditation Council of the
Eurasian Centre for Accreditation
and Quality Assurance
of Education and Health Care
October 2024

**REPORT OF THE
EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION
ON THE RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION OF
THE PROGRAMME "UROLOGY AND ANDROLOGY ADULT, CHILDREN"
LLP "NATIONAL SCIENTIFIC ONCOLOGY CENTER" FOR COMPLIANCE
WITH THE STANDARDS FOR ACCREDITATION OF POSTGRADUATE
EDUCATION PROGRAMMES (RESIDENTIAL SPECIALTIES) OF MEDICAL
EDUCATIONAL ORGANISATIONS**

Period of external expert evaluation: October 22-24, 2024

Astana, 2024

CONTENTS

	List of designations and abbreviations	3
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	4
2.	General part of the final report	5
2.1	Presentation of the educational programme in the specialty of the “NSOC” LLP 7R01126 "Urology and Andrology adult, children's"	6
2.2	Information on previous accreditation	7
2.3	Brief description of the results of the analysis of the report on the self-assessment of the educational programme of the “NSOC” LLP 7R01126 "Urology and Andrology adult, children's" and conclusions on its completeness	8
3.	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion	10
4.	Analysis of compliance with standards for accreditation based on the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme of the “NSOC” LLP 7R01126 "Urology and Andrology adult, children's"	42
5.	Recommendations for improving the educational programme of the “NSOC” LLP 7R01126 "Urology and Andrology adult, children's"	42
6.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council for accreditation of the educational programme of the “NSOC” LLP 7R01126 "Urology and Andrology adult, children's"	42
	Annex 1. Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation and educational programme of residency in specialties of the “NSOC” LLP 7R01126 "Urology and Andrology adult, children's"	43
	Annex 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	44

LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Designation
JSC	Joint-Stock Company
BS	Basic Accreditation Standard
WFME	World Federation for Medical Education
EEC	External Expert Commission
SCES	State Compulsory Educational Standards
DET	Distance Educational Technologies
ECAQA	Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Health Care
End-of-course assessment	End-of-course assessment
IEP	Individual Educational Plan
CED	Catalog of Elective Disciplines
MSHE RK	Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES RK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
NJSC	Non-profit Joint-Stock Company
NSCOT	National Scientific Centre for Oncology and Transplantology
NCIE	National Centre for Independent Examination
NEI	Non-profit Educational Institution
Department	Education Department of the “National Scientific Oncology Centre” LLP
EP	Educational programme
PE	Postgraduate Education
AT	Advanced Training
PC	Practical Class
RT	Retraining
Academic staff	Academic Staff
RSE on the REM	Republican State Enterprise on the Right of Economic Management
RSCEMC	Republican Scientific Centre for Emergency Medical Care
WC	Working Curriculum
QMS	Quality Management System
IWRT	Work of a Resident Doctor under the supervision of a clinical mentor during the period of clinical activity of a resident physician
IWR	independent work of a resident physician
IS	Improvement standard
LLP "NSOC"	LLP "National Scientific Oncology Centre"
EMC	educational and methodological council
GPA	Grade Point Average - the arithmetic mean of grades received for all courses taken, taking into account the time spent on them

1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with the order of the ECAQA No. 33 dated 07.10.2024, the External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) was formed to conduct an external evaluation of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01126 "Urology and Andrology adult, children's" in the period from October 22 to 24, 2024, in the following composition:

№	Status in the EEC	Full name	Academic degree/title, position, place of work/place of study, year, specialty
1	Chairman	Yesenkulova Saule Askerovna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Centre for Postgraduate Education of JSC "Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology", Member of the Association of Oncologists of the Republic of Kazakhstan
2	Foreign expert	Rakhmatullaev Akmal Abadbekovich	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Dean of the 1st Paediatric Faculty, Head of the Department of Faculty Paediatric Surgery, Anaesthesiology and Resuscitation of the Tashkent Paediatric Medical Institute, Awarded the "Mehr-Sakhovat" medal,
3	Academic expert	Dzhambulova Bela Telmanovna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Course on Urology and Andrology of the NEI "Kazakh-Russian Medical University"
4	Academic expert	Iztleuov Yerbolat Maratovich	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Radiology of the NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov", Member of the Local Ethics Commission on Research Work, Internal Auditor of the Quality Management Service.
5	Employers' representative	Ospanova Madina Yeralievna	Head of the Department of Cellular Technologies of the Republican State Enterprise on the Right of Economic Management "Scientific and Production Centre for Transfusiology" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
6	Residents' representative	Aida Kabyldina	second-year resident in the specialty "Radiology" of the NJSC "Astana Medical University"

The EEC report includes a description of the results and the conclusion of the external evaluation of the educational programme of the "NSOC" LLP 7R01126 "Urology and Andrology adult, children's" for compliance with the Standards for accreditation for postgraduate education programs (residency specialties) of medical educational organisations and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Standards for accreditation), recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above-mentioned educational programme and recommendations for accreditation for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

2. General part of the final report

2.1 Presentation of the educational residency programme in the specialty "Urology and Andrology adult, children's"

Name of the organisation, legal form of ownership, BIN	<i>Limited Liability Partnership "National Scientific Oncology Centre"</i> <i>BIN 180740003103</i>
Managing body	Board
Full name of the first director	Burkitbayev Zhandos Konysovich
Date of establishment	May 1, 2019
Location and contact details	<i>Republic of Kazakhstan, 010000</i> <i>Astana, "Nura" district,</i> <i>Kerey st., Zhanibek khandar, 3</i> <i>Tel.: +7 (7172) 70 29 59</i> <i>E-mail: kense.777@mail.ru</i> <i>Official website: http://cancercenter.kz</i>
State license for educational activities in residency (date, number)	<i>Licenses No. KZ59LAA00035999 dated 12/14/2023</i>
Year of commencement of educational activities in residency (postgraduate education) and total number of graduates	Start year - 2019 Total 181
Duration of training in residency	Educational programme 1) "Adult oncology" - 2 years of study; 2) "Adult Haematology" - 2 years of study; 3) "Radiology" - 2 years of study; 4) "Adult and Paediatric Gastroenterology" - 2 years of study; 5) "General Surgery" - 3 years of study; 6) "Urology and Andrology adult, children's" - 3 years of study; 7) "Adult and Paediatric Anaesthesiology and Resuscitation" - 3 years of study; 8) "Adult and Paediatric Angiosurgery" - 4 years of study;
Number of residents in the current academic year	Educational programme 1) "Adult Oncology" - 13; 2) "Adult Haematology" - 16; 3) "Radiology" - 18; 4) "Adult and Paediatric Gastroenterology" - 7; 5) "General surgery" - 17; 6) "Urology and Andrology adult, children's" - 9; 7) "Anaesthesiology and resuscitation for adults and children" - 10; 8) "Angiosurgery for adults and children" - 19;
Quality indicators in residency	The number of students expelled over a 5-year period is 0, including 0 for academic failure. Graduates – 181 Employment rate, % in dynamics over 5 years: 2019 - 100% 2020 - 100% 2021 - 100% 2022 - 100% 2023 - 100% 2024 - 100%

Full-time teachers/part-time workers involved in the implementation of residency and additional education programmes, incl. % of Sedateness	Total number of teachers – 63, including full-time - 63, part-time - 0. Sedateness 58%
Presence of a department responsible for the educational process	Name: Educational Department Year of establishment 2019. Head of Department: Zhukubayeva Almira Assetkyzy, Master of Education, highest category doctor in healthcare organisation.
Number of scientific projects over 5 years	5
Number of international agreements over 5 years	25
Website Instagram Facebook with active pages	Official website: http://cancercenter.kz Instagram – https://www.instagram.com/astana.nroc https://www.facebook.com/astana.nroc
Information on accreditation as a medical organisation (date, No., period)	No. KZ70VEG00013182 10.03.2023

2.2 Information about previous accreditation

The previous accreditation of the educational programme "Urology and Andrology adult, children's" was carried out by the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care. The accreditation is valid from 20.04.2022 to 19.04.2025.

2.3 Brief description of the results of the analysis of the self-assessment report of the educational residency programme in the specialty "Urology and Andrology adult, children's" and conclusions on its completeness

The self-assessment report of the residency educational programme in the specialty 7R01126 "Urology and Andrology adult, children's" (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 112 pages of the main text, annexes on 54 pages.

The report is characterized by comprehensive responses to all 9 main accreditation standards and their criteria, structured in accordance with the recommendations of the ECAQA Guidelines for Self-Assessment of Medical Educational Organisations, provided by the accreditation center – ECAQA, and demonstrates internal consistency of information. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by the Deputy Chair of the Board for Scientific and Educational Affairs of LLP "National Scientific Oncology Center" (NSOC), S.B. Shalekenov, confirming the accuracy of the quantitative data and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report includes a list of five members of the internal self-assessment commission, specifying the responsibilities of each member, as well as information about the representative of the organisation responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme – S.B. Shalekenov, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Deputy Chair of the Board for Scientific and Educational Affairs.

The self-assessment of the educational programme was conducted based on Order No. 273 dated September 13, 2024, "On the Establishment of a Working Group for Institutional and Specialized Self-Assessment and Report Preparation".

Each standard presents the actual practices of the educational organisation in training residents in the specialty 7R01126 "Urology and Andrology adult, children's". The descriptions in the self-assessment report are sufficiently detailed and up-to-date in terms of the number of residents, trainees, faculty, administration, admission and selection processes, learning outcomes, and assessment of knowledge and skills. The report includes information on the organisation's own material and technical

base with a total area of 58,000 m² and 210 hospital beds, as well as on affiliated clinical bases (a total of 100 beds), contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, clinical bases), financial data, and development and improvement plans, among others.

The report was submitted to ECAQA in a finalized form, with data adjusted according to the above-mentioned recommendations. It is written in a competent and clear language; the wording for each standard is explicit and corresponds to the standard criteria. Tables and figures (diagrams, photos) are referenced in the text and are sequentially numbered.

3. Description of the external expert evaluation

The external expert work within the framework of the evaluation of the educational programme of the "NSOC" LLP 7R01126 "Urology and Andrology adult, children's" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external assessment of educational organisations and educational programmes of the ECAQA/ Dates of the visit to the organisation: October 22-24, 2024. The sequence of the visit over 3 days is presented in detail in Annex 3 to this report

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

- interviews with management and administrative staff – 7 people;
- interviews with residents – 7 people;
- studying the website <http://cancercenter.edu.kz/>;
- interviewing 8 (number) employees, 8 (number) teachers, 4 mentors;
- questionnaires for teachers and residents - 5 and 5, respectively;
- observation of resident training: attendance at a practical session on the topic "Classification, Diagnosis, and Treatment of Bladder Cancer" conducted by Instructor Z.T. Kubeyev, held in the assembly hall of the NSOC;
- review of resources in the context of compliance with accreditation standards. Two clinical training bases were visited, with the participation of 4 full-time faculty members:
 - Municipal State Enterprise on the Right of Economic Management "Oncology Center of Astana City": 30 surgical beds, including 8 urology beds.
 - Corporate Fund "University Medical Center": 20 adult multiprofile surgical beds, including 2 adult urology beds and 30 pediatric urology beds.
- Review of academic and methodological documents – a total of 18 items were studied both prior to the site visit and during visits to the respective departments (a list of documents is provided in Appendix 2).
- A meeting and interview were held with teaching staff of the educational programme: Mugalbekov Shalkarbek Bakirovich, Asykpayev Mels Nursseitovich, and with residents: Tileukhan Mukhtar, Adek Kurban.
- Simulation room: PhD Murat Bolatovich Zhumabayev, anesthesiologist-resuscitator.

The teaching staff of the accredited organisation ensured the presence of all persons listed in the site visit programme and in the interview and meeting participant lists.

On the final day of the site visit, a meeting of the EEC members was held to discuss the results of the external evaluation. The final discussion included the outcomes of the external review of the educational programme, document analysis, interviews, meetings, and questionnaire surveys. The EEC members began drafting the final report. A synthesis of the results of the external evaluation was conducted. The expert completed the "Quality Profile and Criteria Evaluation Form" for the educational programme 7R01126 "Urology and Andrology adult, children's" in accordance with ECAQA Accreditation Standards. Recommendations for the improvement of the educational programme were discussed, and an open final vote on the recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council was conducted by the Chair, S.A. Yesenkulova.

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC, with access to all necessary information and material resources. The Commission noted the high level of corporate culture at NSOC and the organisation's high degree of transparency in providing information to EEC members.

During the residents' questionnaire survey, 100% evaluated the work of the External Expert Commission on accreditation positively. All respondents (100%) believe that accreditation of the educational organisation or its programmes is necessary.

According to 100% of faculty members, the ECAQA-conducted questionnaire was useful in developing recommendations for improving the key activities of the accredited educational organisation. At the end of the site visit programme, the Chair of the EEC presented the recommendations based on the external review to the management and staff of the educational organisation as part of the specialized accreditation process.

4. Analysis of compliance with standards for accreditation based on the results of external evaluation of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01126 "Urology and Andrology adult, children's"

Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES

1.1 Mission statement

During the implementation of the program's activities, and specifically based on the results of the interviews conducted by the EEC members with the Deputy Chairman of the Board for Medical Affairs, A.K. Mukazhanov, and members of the Board of the NSOC, as well as interviews with residents and faculty members, compliance with the criteria of **Standard 1** was established. All participants in the educational process are aware of the mission of the educational programme and took part in developing proposals for formulating the mission. The mission is communicated to potential residents through the website, social media, and information letters sent to medical organisations. The Strategic Plan of the NSOC for 2024–2028 was reviewed. It is aligned with the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan and approved by the Supervisory Board of the NSOC on August 16, 2024, confirming compliance with the accreditation standard and demonstrating the organisation's goals, objectives, and future outlook. According to interviews with residents, instructors inform them about the mission and the organisation's educational plans at the beginning of the training. They also explain where to find the necessary information about the educational programme, teaching staff, and training bases.

During visits to the institution's units, the experts noted the strengths of the educational organisation with regard to the accredited educational programme. Specifically, the NSOC operates departments directly related to the educational programme 7R01126 "Urology and Andrology adult, children's" which can be considered best practices in education.

The NSOC is an innovation-oriented medical organisation that is competitive in the market of medical, educational, and innovative services through the continuous development of human resources, infrastructure, and the creation of intellectual products, as well as integration into the international educational and scientific space.

This conclusion was drawn because resident physicians and trainees have the opportunity to study modern innovative technologies implemented in medical centers in Astana, participate in master classes conducted by foreign specialists, and work with modern equipment.

The implemented resident assessment methods serve as tools to evaluate the progress of residents' academic achievements and the development of such competencies as medical knowledge, skills, and professionalism.

The review of documentation demonstrates that the mission of the organisation and the mission of the educational programme "Urology and Andrology adult, children's" align with each other, and the educational process is conducted in accordance with the State Compulsory Education Standard (SCES) and the current regulatory legal acts in postgraduate education and healthcare.

The educational organisation conducts resident training in urology at the following clinical bases and departments:

1. MSE on the REM "Oncology Center of Astana" (since 08.07.2019). 30 surgical beds, including 8 urological beds.

2. Corporate Fund "University Medical Center" (Contract No. 1963 dated 18.10.2019). 20 adult general surgery beds, including 2 adult urology beds, and 30 pediatric urology beds.
3. LLP "Green Clinic" (Contract No. 1 dated 10.05.2023). General surgery department – 55 beds, including 6 urological beds.
4. MSE on the REM "Multiprofile Regional Hospital No. 2" (Contract No. 1 dated 05.10.2020). Urological beds – 22.
5. RSE "Hospital of the Medical Center of the Administrative Department of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan" (Contract No. 1 dated 15.09.2021). Urological beds – 24.
6. MSE on the REM "City Polyclinic No. 9" (Contract No. 40 dated 19.04.202_). Reception of urological patients.
7. LLP "Format" (Contract dated 05.02.2024).
8. LLP "Multiprofile Medical Center Meirim" (Contract dated 24.10.2023).

Thus, there is a sufficient material and technical base for training future urologist-andrologists, which includes 92 urological beds (including 30 pediatric beds).

The clinics provide a patient-centered approach since resident training is conducted in centers offering highly specialized care. These centers are well-equipped and allow residents to fully master the required skills in accordance with SCES requirements for residency. The educational organisation pays due attention to patient safety and autonomy. To enhance the effectiveness of staff performance, the NSOC has developed and implemented principles of professional ethics and basic rules of official conduct, which are to be followed by all employees, regardless of their position.

Experts found that residents are provided with adequate working conditions that support their own health. The administration takes measures to ensure residents have proper conditions for learning and working in clinical settings. Residents have designated workplaces located in doctors' lounges, as well as classrooms and computer labs for working with documentation and databases. Resident physicians are provided with personal protective equipment at the expense of the NSOC, in accordance with the standards of the Chief Sanitary Doctor of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The NSOC allocates resources to support the social well-being of resident physicians. There are public catering points for students, staff, and visitors located on the basement level.

The NSOC has a canteen operating on the ground floor with an area of 202.1 m² and a seating capacity of over 50 people. There is also a food preparation area with a size of 144.9 m².

The following core competencies of residents in the accredited specialty help the educational organisation apply innovative teaching methods:

1. General and specific skills
2. Medical knowledge
3. Ability to learn and develop
4. Communication skills
5. Professionalism
6. Research
7. System-based practice
8. Employment upon graduation

These support the development of: general and specific skills, medical knowledge, learning and development ability, communication skills, professionalism, research, and system-based practice.

The NSOC supports and promotes the academic freedom of resident physicians through meetings with the leadership of the education department and the NSOC administration, where residents are encouraged to express their opinions about the training programme. Additionally, residents are motivated to publish, present at conferences, and participate in various educational events within the NSOC and beyond.

1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy

Experts have identified that the NSOC has a Standard Operating Procedure (SOP) titled "Educational Process for Resident Physicians," Order No. 416-OD dated December 30, 2022, which

reflects all stages and components of the educational process, involved structures, and available resources.

The procedure for the selection and admission of resident physicians is regulated by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018, No. 600 “On the Approval of the Standard Rules for Admission to Education in Organisations Implementing Educational Programmes of Higher and Postgraduate Education” (<https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/V1800017650>), as well as by the internal regulatory document (hereinafter – IRD) approved by the Order of the Chairman of the Management Board dated July 10, 2024, No. 226 “Academic Policy of the National Scientific Oncological Center LLP”, which defines the procedure for admission to residency at NSOC.

The NSOC implements a competency-based model of medical education focused on learning outcomes. Based on international approaches, the working curricula for each discipline have been reviewed and approved.

Decisions regarding the development of educational programmes, evaluation, selection and admission of resident physicians, appointment of faculty and research supervisors, and employment of graduates, etc., are made in accordance with current legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and internal Rules for Organizing the Educational Process in Residency – the NSOC Academic Policy, approved by Order No. 226 dated July 10, 2024.

Resident employment is regulated by the State Educational Order and currently stands at 100%.

To verify **Standard 1**, a meeting was held with the Deputy Chairman of the NSOC Management Board for Medical Affairs, Mr. A.K. Mukazhanov. During the meeting, the experts asked the following questions:

1. What is the annual volume of surgical interventions performed in the field of urology at the multidisciplinary surgical department?
2. How many patients with uro-andrological conditions were discharged after treatment from the inpatient unit?
3. Do urology residents have access to modern diagnostic and treatment equipment to acquire all the practical skills stipulated in the Urology and Andrology adult, children’s Educational Programme?

In response, the Deputy Head of the organisation provided the annual clinical activity report of the urology division of the NSOC multidisciplinary department and confirmed that all urology residents have full access to modern diagnostic and treatment equipment during their training, including X-ray, ultrasound, endoscopic equipment, modern laparoscopes, and more.

Academic freedom for residents is supported through the organisation of meetings with the leadership of the NSOC education department, where residents are encouraged to express their opinions regarding the educational programme. Residents are also motivated to publish, speak at conferences, and participate in various educational events within and outside the NSOC.

Resident physicians are directly involved in the formation of their Individual Curriculum (IC) for each academic year in collaboration with their clinical mentor, which grants them the right to choose an individual learning pathway. In addition, residents are granted the freedom to select disciplines included in the Catalog of Elective Disciplines (CED). For example, residents specializing in “Urology and Andrology adult, children”, in collaboration with their instructors, selected elective courses such as Clinical Urodynamics, Transplantology, and Reconstructive Urology.

To gather feedback and improve the educational programme based on international best practices, a “360-Degree Feedback Survey” has been introduced, which includes 7 different questionnaires. Participants of this survey include resident physicians of all training years, clinical mentors, supervising physicians, faculty members, and patients of the residents. The survey is conducted once a year using paper-based questionnaires.

While conducting a survey of 27 residents (on the resource <https://webanketa.com/>), out of 22 questions, a number were devoted to the quality of the educational process and the educational

programme. It was found that 63% of residents would recommend studying in this educational organisation to their acquaintances, friends, relatives. And 63% of respondents believe that the heads of the educational programme and teachers are aware of the problems of students related to training. To the question "Do you think this educational organisation allows you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in your chosen specialty?", 78% of residents answered positively, 4% are not sure about this, 7% could not answer this question yet and 11% would like to believe it.

The 21 teachers surveyed (21 questions in the questionnaire) also answered that 91% are satisfied with the organisation of work and the workplace in this educational organisation, and 9% partially agree with this statement. The experts determined that the organisation has a healthy microclimate, since the manager is quite accessible to both residents and employees, and responds promptly to applications. In the questionnaire, 85% of teachers are satisfied with the microclimate of the organisation, and 15% are partially satisfied. According to 85%, in the educational organisation, a teacher has the opportunity to realize himself as a professional in his specialty. For your information, a total of 21 people answered, while 62% have up to 5 years of teaching experience, 19% have up to 10 years, and 19% have over 10 years of teaching experience.

1.3 Final learning outcomes

The final learning outcomes of the NSOC residency Educational Programme in the specialty "Urology and Andrology adult, children" are defined in the EPVO.kz Registry.

Experts confirmed that residents' professional conduct and communication skills are developed through the cultivation of proper ethics within the team and respectful relationships among colleagues and toward patients. In order to ensure that staff members perform their professional duties with integrity, to promote the status of medical workers in society, and to establish a unified moral and normative foundation for behavior at the NSOC, the Code of Business Ethics of the NSOC was approved by the NSOC Supervisory Board on October 31, 2019. This Code was developed in accordance with the Code of Honour of Medical and Pharmaceutical Workers (Article 274 of the Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Public Health and the Healthcare System" dated July 7, 2020), the current legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan, internationally recognized standards of professional conduct, and based on the Charter and other internal documents of the organisation.

The Code of Business Ethics is based on the principles of corporate social responsibility. Students at the NSOC are guided by universal moral and ethical principles and adhere to the corporate culture. Interethnic differences, religious extremism, nationalism and corruption offenses are unacceptable at the NSOC. The academic quality of the NSOC teachers helps support the further development of students' commitment to the continuous development of professional competencies, scientific knowledge, and the principle of confidentiality of information concerning the patient. The experts familiarized themselves with the content of the Code of Ethics on the official website: <http://cancercenter.kz>.

When determining the final learning outcomes, the NSOC staff took into account the previous learning outcomes in the bachelor's degree and internship, and also took into account the goals and objectives of subsequent continuous professional development in the chosen specialty.

The surveyed teachers answered that 33.33% (7 (21)) are fully satisfied with the level of previous training of residents, and 52.38% (11 (21)) are partially satisfied. 14.29% (3 (21)) are partially dissatisfied. The experts established a clear continuity between the final results of the previous training of residents (prerequisites) and training in residency, and subsequent programs of continuous professional development. The organisation has developed 3 programs of additional education, including for the specialty "Urology and Andrology adult, children". Residents are informed about this. 76% of the respondent teachers believe that students of this educational organisation have a high level of knowledge and practical skills after completing the training program, and 24% partially agree with this.

1.4 Participation in the formulation of the mission and final outcomes

Residents, employers, administrative and management personnel, and teaching staff took part in developing the goals and objectives of the educational programme "Urology and Andrology adult, children". Suggestions included more efficient use of information and communication technologies in

the management system; improvement of funding mechanisms for all levels of education (academic mobility of residents, participation of residents in international events). When updated regulatory legal acts and orders in education and healthcare are issued, the developers of the educational programme take into account the proposals of interested parties and make appropriate changes.

Conclusions of the EEC by criteria. Comply out of 14 standards (including 9 basic, 5 improvement standards): fully - 12, partially - 2, do not comply - 0.

Recommendations for improvement:

1.1.6 – To allocate (provide) a budget for conducting internal scientific research with the involvement of residents, as well as for sending to scientific conferences with a report.

1.4.2 – While forming the Mission and outcomes of the EP, to more actively involve stakeholders: residents, Academic staff, clinical mentors, employers and graduates.

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME

2.1 Framework parameters of the postgraduate medical education program

Personnel training in residency are carried out in clinical specialties approved by the order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated May 25, 2021 No RK MOH - 43 "On approval of the list of medical specialties of residency programs".

The structure and content of the residency programme "Urology and Andrology adult, children" corresponds to the State Compulsory Education Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan 2018, 2022 (order No. 647 dated July 31, 2015 with amendments and additions dated February 21, 2020, Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 4, 2022 No RK MOH-63; registered with the Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan on July 5, 2022 No. 28716).

The model of the educational programme in the specialty Urology and Andrology adult, children is determined on the basis of the final learning outcomes of residents, therefore it includes the following: the final learning outcomes of the residency programme are aimed at mastering general key competencies and professional competencies, Professional Standards in Healthcare (<https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/G24RR000046>) and are reflected in the programme. The learning outcomes are formulated both for the entire programme and for each discipline. To achieve them, resident doctors acquire theoretical knowledge and practical skills in the disciplines of the compulsory component (hereinafter referred to as CC) and the disciplines of the elective component (hereinafter referred to as EC), which are developed taking into account the specifics and focus, strengths of the teachers/mentors of the NSOC. Duration of training is 2 years. The systematicity and transparency of training is guaranteed by the fact that all training conditions are provided with systematicity, continuity of their content, consistent development of all competencies depending on the specialty, takes into account the logic of the academic relationship of disciplines, their continuity. The model of the residency programme based on the established final results of training of residents and the qualifications they receive is also ensured by the transparency of training. Residents and teachers are informed about the necessary competencies that both students and teachers acquire. This occurs in conditions of openness and awareness of the successes of residents. The EP of the NSOC residency is freely available to interested parties in the Register of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan https://epvo.kz/#/register/education_program and on the NSOC website (<http://cancercenter.edu/kz>), Instagram account – <https://www.instagram.com/astana.nroc/>, Facebook account - <https://www.facebook.com/astana.nroc>.

To implement the educational programme in the specialty 7R01126 "Urology and Andrology adult, children", the organisation's documents contain educational and methodological complexes, which define the goal, take into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, and independent work.

During a visit to a practical class on the topic "Benign Prostatic Hyperplasia" (6 academic hours), the experts obtained convincing evidence that the training is conducted according to plan. Before the session, residents take a test, receive feedback from the instructor, and have the opportunity to improve their transurethral correction skills.

The organisation ensures compliance with ethical standards in the implementation of the educational programme, as the experts reviewed the Code of Ethics (approval date), and during interviews, residents confirmed that they were informed about the contents of this document.

Analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all scientific achievements in the relevant disciplines are taken into account, additions are made to the bibliography of the EMCD and syllabuses, and teachers use them in classes.

The qualification obtained as a result of mastering the educational programme in the specialty of urology corresponds to level 8 of the national qualification framework (ESG 1.2) and has the code 7R01126 - "Urology and Andrology adult, children".

Thus, by the end of the two-year training, residents will have acquired the core skills and competencies required for the profession of "urologist and andrologist", which will allow them to work in all healthcare organisations (ESG 1.2).

The experts did not identify any violations regarding the principle of equality in postgraduate education and continuous professional development, as the educational organisation complies with the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Law on the Languages of the Peoples of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and other regulatory legal acts in the fields of education and healthcare.

Residents are trained to obtain informed consent from patients in a timely manner before conducting any diagnostic or therapeutic procedures. Experts noted that relevant signed consent forms were present in the patients' medical records.

2.2 Scientific methodr

The educational programme "Urology and Andrology adult, children" includes the acquisition of the competency "Research" (PC5). The integration of scientific principles and research methodology into the educational programme is based on the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Science." As part of this direction, a development, support, and promotion program for researchers of the scientific center is being developed and implemented by engaging residents and young scientists under the age of 35 in the implementation of research programs and projects.

During interviews with residents, the experts learned that they use scientific data in their training and are familiar with the fundamentals of evidence-based medicine. Instructors reported that they train residents in the methods of critical appraisal of literature, scientific articles, and data, as well as the application of scientific developments. This form of education is organized as a "Journal Club", which is held once a month.

To promote the professional development of residents, the NSOC operates a "Journal Club", within which seminars, master classes, conferences, and round tables on current topics are conducted. Together with staff and invited experts—both domestic and international—resident physicians discuss interesting clinical cases, new technologies in clinical fields, global research, and case studies. Lectures are delivered on topics such as scientific foundations, research methodology, article writing, and more. Residents actively participate in scientific conferences. Below is a list of residents and the topics of their presentations in 2023:

№	Full Name of Resident Physician	Topics	Year
1	Adilov A.A.	Scientific and Practical Conference "Interdisciplinary Approach in the Treatment of Urological Diseases", Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan	2023
2	Zhaksylyk Zh.N.	1st Eurasian Forum on Onco-Urology, Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan. Topic: Experience in Laparoscopic Organ-Preserving Surgeries at the NSOC	2023
3	Adilov A.A.	CACU 2023 – Central Asian Congress of Urologists, Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan. Topic: Kidney Autotransplantation	2023

4	Ashtai N.B.	CACU 2023 – Central Asian Congress of Urologists, Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan. Poster Presentation: Complications of Circumcision	2023
5	Tileukhan M.N.	Young Scientists' Conference at the NSOC. Topic: Cardiological Aspects in Kidney Transplant Recipients	2024

In 2024, the faculty published eight printed works: one textbook and five teaching and methodological recommendations. The educational materials were reviewed and approved by the S. Kairbekova National Scientific Center for Health Development under the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Educational and Methodological Association of the Republican Educational and Methodological Council (EMA REMC).

When surveying residents, it was found that the educational organisation has access to the participation of students in research work and 86% of people are completely satisfied with this, 14% are partially satisfied. Residents should engage in R&D and in response to the questionnaire, 42% wrote that they are already engaged in R&D, 24% are planning to start, 26% are looking for a topic for R&D, 8% are not engaged.

2.3 Structure, content and duration of the residency programme

The residency training programme contains:

- 1) theoretical training, including the study of cycles of basic, core disciplines and an elective component;
- 2) clinical training of the resident;
- 3) End-of-course assessment.

In accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard, the curricula maintain a ratio of the volume of disciplines depending on the duration of study:

- 1) core disciplines of the compulsory component - 94% of the total volume of disciplines of the standard curriculum (132 credits);
- 2) elective component - 2.8% of the total volume of disciplines (4 credits) is allocated to the disciplines of the elective component.

The educational programme of the residency in the specialty 7R01126 "Urology and Andrology adult, children" is compiled in accordance with the requirements of the State Compulsory Educational Standard (order of the Minister of Health dated January 9, 2023 No. 4, <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/V2300031672>), includes the core disciplines of the compulsory component and the elective component. Changes have been made to comply with the requirements of the Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 25, 2024 No. 46 "On approval of professional standards in the field of health care" (professional Standard "Urology and Andrology adult, children", according to Appendix 41 to this order).

The educational programme of residency in the specialty "Urology and Andrology adult, children" contains 8 disciplines (compulsory component).

The CED is a systematized annotated list of all disciplines of the elective component. The CED provides students with an alternative choice of elective academic disciplines.

A resident physician selects an elective discipline in the academic year to master the educational programme of the corresponding level.

The compulsory component contains 8 disciplines (4020 hours) and an elective component (120 hours), 60 hours for final certification.

The elective component allows residents to create an individual learning path.

An analysis of the progress and results of the educational process (at meetings of the EMC) showed that training in residency educational programmes is carried out with a clear focus on the goals of the studied disciplines, taking into account the competence-based approach. The purpose of training in the core discipline Urology and Andrology adult, children is to form the competitiveness of residency graduates in the labour market, which ensures the possibility of prompt employment in specialties. A systematic review and adjustment of the WC for elective disciplines is carried out. The catalogue of

elective disciplines is expanded in the range of disciplines according to the professional orientation of the resident and according to their wishes and employment issues. Good theoretical and practical training of the student and their demand in practical healthcare allows employing all comers in the specialty.

In accordance with the requirements of the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 4, 2022 No. RK MOH-63 "On approval of state mandatory standards for levels of education in the field of health care" <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/V2200028716> and the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 01/09/2023 No. 4 "On approval of standard curricula for medical and pharmaceutical specialties" <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/V2300031672> NSOC was developed and included in the Register of Higher and Postgraduate Education of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan with an acceptable coefficient of attainability of learning outcomes of the residency program - 7R01126 "Urology and Andrology adult, children" - 2 years of study.

Residency training at the NSOC includes theoretical training (classroom work) in the amount of - 20%, clinical training under the supervision of a mentor in the amount of - 65%, independent training of the resident in the amount of - 15% of the total volume of the curriculum.

The educational and methodological documentation of the residency includes the following documents:

- Educational programme;
- Standard curriculum;
- Working curriculum;
- Individual curriculum;
- Catalogue of elective disciplines;
- Academic calendar;
- Syllabuses;
- Control and measuring tools.

The EP of the NSOC residency is freely available to interested parties in the Register of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan https://epvo.kz/#/register/education_program.

Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes, in which 60% are fully satisfied, 40% are partially satisfied.

The organisation has its own clinical base with 360 beds and 300 outpatient visits, and has also concluded agreements with other medical organisations. And to the question of the questionnaire "Is there enough time for practical training (patient supervision, etc.)", 75% of residents answered with full agreement, 25% partially agree. At the same time, 100% of residents claim that after the end of classes, the teacher provides feedback (listens to your opinion, conducts a mini-questionnaire, works on mistakes).

At the NSOC, in order to develop residents' skills in critically appraising literature, writing scientific articles, and preparing publications, lectures are delivered by experts with extensive research experience. For example, within the framework of the "Journal Club", a lecture was held on "How to Write a Clinical Trial Protocol and Register It on ClinicalTrials.gov". Additionally, the editor of the NSOC journal Oncology.kz conducts training sessions and shares expertise with residents and staff on how to write, properly format, and submit articles to both national and international journals.

Independent work of resident physicians also includes working with core and supplementary literature, scientific data, preparing abstracts and presentations on specific topics. As part of independent work, residents (hereinafter referred to as IWR), residents are also encouraged to analyze scientific publications from the standpoint of evidence-based medicine on assigned oncology-related topics. Through independent study of scientific literature in periodicals and online resources, residents develop critical and scientific thinking skills.

2.4 Organisation of training and the relationship between postgraduate medical education and the provision of medical care

The NSOC implements the residency program in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 21, 2020 No RK MOH -304/2020 "On approval

of the provisions on the clinical base, clinic of the organisation of education in the field of health care, university hospital, residency base, integrated academic medical centre and the requirements imposed on them" <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/V2000021848> in departments providing highly specialized planned, inpatient, outpatient, diagnostic care and at external clinical bases.

The training of resident doctors is carried out in order to provide the healthcare industry with qualified personnel capable of providing medical care to the population with various diseases.

In order to provide educational services in core disciplines according to the State Educational Standard, which are not available at the NNEC, agreements have been concluded with third-party organisations for the provision of a clinical base for training resident doctors of the NSOC, as well as with individuals for the provision of educational services on a reimbursable basis.

10 contracts for training resident doctors have been concluded with:

- NJSC "Astana Medical University";
- MSE on the REM "Multidisciplinary Medical Centre" of the Akimat of Astana
- MSE "City Children's Hospital No. 1";
- MSE on the REM "Multidisciplinary Regional Hospital No. 2;
- CF "University Medical Centre";
- CF UMC "Motherhood and Childhood";
- RSE "Hospital of the Medical Centre of the Presidential Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on the REM;
- LLP "Aesthetic Life";
- MSE on the REM "City Polyclinic No. 9" of the Akimat of Astana;
- MSE on the REM "Multidisciplinary Regional Hospital No. 3".

In subsequent academic periods, it is planned to rotate resident doctors in medical organisations providing preventive, advisory, diagnostic and therapeutic care in various healthcare organisations in the regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan in accordance with Annex 50 of the Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 9, 2023 No. 4 "On approval of standard curricula for medical and pharmaceutical specialties" <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/V2300031672> .

Clinical bases that can train resident doctors are multidisciplinary medical organisations providing primary, specialized, emergency care to the population of the Republic of Kazakhstan at the outpatient and inpatient stages.

The NSOC has defined the procedure for developing and approving the residency programme, which includes the stages of planning, discussion, approval, review and implementation. The NSOC ensures that the advisory bodies include specialists, residents and other relevant stakeholders. The Educational and Methodological Council and the Department are responsible for managing the educational programme. Residents are involved in the process of evaluating the program by expressing their opinions and wishes at the end of the course of study or mastering a specific discipline by means of a questionnaire to identify opinions and suggestions as direct consumers. Residents' comments and suggestions on the organisation of the educational process (class schedule, etc.), the content of elective disciplines and other issues directly related to the educational process may be taken into account.

Planning, development, approval and implementation of the residency program at the NSOC are carried out by developers (doctors) in accordance with the regulatory and qualification requirements for the implementation of the residency program.

The development of the EP is carried out by a working group, which includes potential teachers/mentors of the NSOC and external stakeholders - representatives of practical healthcare. The developed EP is reviewed at department meetings; the EP is presented to practical healthcare specialists/potential employers for review (feedback).

Of the 14 residents surveyed, 67% responded that teachers use active and interactive teaching methods in classes quite often, while 22% believe that they do so rarely or sometimes.

Conclusions of the EEC by criteria. Comply with 22 standards (including 19 basic, 3 Standard improvement): fully -22.

Standard 3: RESIDENT ASSESSMENT

3.1 Assessment methods

The following belong to the documentation reflecting the educational achievements of the resident physician:

- 1) the portfolio of the resident physician;
- 2) the attendance log;
- 3) examination reports.

Assessment of the educational achievements of residents is carried out on the basis of an assessment of the level of competencies developed by the teacher together with the education department of the NSOC in various forms: test questions, assignments in test form, a list of practical skills, situational tasks, assessment of the level of mastery of a specific manipulation by the resident physician, assignments for laboratory and other work.

In the NSOC, monitoring, internal control of the quality of training and educational achievements of students is carried out through final control in the discipline and is focused on learning outcomes.

Persons who have scored the highest points in the entrance exams on a 100-point grading scale are admitted to the residency of the NSOC. The academic achievements of the resident are assessed on a 100-point scale corresponding to the internationally accepted letter system with a digital equivalent on a 4-point scale, the records of which are maintained by the NSOC Education Department. To monitor and evaluate the current academic performance of resident physicians, the NSOC uses assessment, including an assessment, a list of practical skills. Experts have studied the list of practical skills (LPS), which reflects the accounting of educational achievements aimed at mastering a minimum number of clinical skills over the entire period of study. The final knowledge assessment upon completion of each discipline is carried out in the form of an oral exam or in the form of testing/solving situational problems.

The experts familiarized themselves with the electronic database of standardized tests for all the studied disciplines of the educational programme "Urology and Andrology adult, children". The content and number of tests (more than 300) cover the entire scope of the studied disciplines.

The NSOC adheres to state requirements regarding the organisation and administration of final certification (FC) for resident physicians. Discussions with staff of the education department and residents revealed that the FC is conducted within the timeframes established by the academic calendar and the Work Curriculum (WC) of the specialty. It is held in the form of a comprehensive examination, which is open to those residents who have completed the full course of residency training at the NSOC in accordance with the requirements of the WC, Individual Educational Plan (IEP), and their portfolio. Final-year resident physicians who have not fulfilled the requirements of the WC, IEP, and working curricula must repeat the course on a paid basis without taking the summer semester.

The Head of the Education Department, Zhukubayeva A.A., explained that an Attestation Commission (AC) is formed at the NSOC to conduct the comprehensive examination for residents. The number of members on the AC is determined by the NSOC and approved by an order from the Deputy Chairman of the NSOC Management Board. The schedule of the AC is approved by the Chairman of the NSOC Management Board and announced at least two weeks before the commission begins its work.

Residents stated that the comprehensive specialty examination consists of a test and a practical skills assessment. Experts reviewed the examination records for 2022–2023, which include the results of the comprehensive exam as well as the FC protocols. The protocols contain the resident's average grade across all types of assessments and are signed by the Chairperson of the Attestation Commission.

Residents are aware that retaking the comprehensive exam to improve a passing grade is not allowed. A resident physician who disagrees with their exam result may file an appeal no later than 1:00 p.m. the next working day. Residents are also aware that an Appeals Commission is formed to review such cases. A resident physician who does not achieve the minimum passing score is subject to dismissal.

Experts confirmed that individuals who complete the educational programme and successfully pass the final certification are awarded a qualification in the corresponding specialty and issued a state-recognized diploma.

During the site visit, the leadership was asked: “Are external examiners involved to enhance fairness, quality, and transparency of the assessment process?” The response was: “Yes, of course. We engage part-time examiners from other medical organisations and universities, and independent assessments are also conducted”.

However, it was found that grades are currently recorded in a paper-based logbook, which only includes grades for practical classes. According to the administration, negotiations are underway to purchase the Platonus AIS (Automated Information System), which will enable the use of an electronic gradebook.

3.2 Relationship between assessment and learning

During interviews with 21 teachers regarding assessment methods, experts received convincing information that the university views assessment of residents' knowledge as a process of collecting information to make judgments about the degree and nature of the student's progress toward achieving the requirements of the standard for his or her future work as a physician. Residents also shared their opinions about the timeliness of testing, pre-examination counselling, the clarity of the entire assessment procedure, and its fairness.

The Academic staff also works effectively to improve and enhance their professional competence (for example, in the period from April 8 to April 19, 2024, 38 people from the teaching staff of the NSOC underwent training on the topic “Current aspects of a teacher of postgraduate and additional education” with the issuance of certificates (invited lecturer Fursov Alexander Borisovich, MD, Professor, Head of the Department of Surgery of the NJSC “AMU”; also in the period from December 6 to December 10, 2021, 20 Academic staff underwent training on the topic: “School of a clinical mentor” with the issuance of a certificate of the “Republican Medical Institute” LLP).

During their clinical training, residents are involved daily in interprofessional collaboration with physicians of various specialties, including internal medicine, pediatrics, anesthesiology, oncology, and functional diagnostics. They actively participate in morning medical meetings, pathological conferences, and clinical case consultations. Case studies have been developed to help residents master interdisciplinary approaches to patient care. Residents also acquire practical skills through multidisciplinary training sessions, such as those conducted within the Young Radiologist School and the Journal Club. This information was confirmed in interviews with residents from various specialties.

Experts found that the selection of resident assessment methods is based on OSCE and Mini-CEX, as the practical component of the training is a priority. It was confirmed that teaching and assessment methods, educational programmes, and evaluation tools are regularly reviewed based on feedback from stakeholders (employers, residents).

According to the Head of the Education Department, the Platonus AIS will be launched in the near future (a contract has been signed with LLP “Platonus”, No. 543 dated August 6, 2024). At present, the system is being populated with data. The entire educational process will be reflected in Platonus. To support implementation, a dedicated classroom with desktop computers, internet access, and electronic library databases has been provided. In addition, there are lecture halls and a conference room equipped with multimedia equipment.

Conclusions of the EEC by criteria out of 9 standards (including 6 basic, 3 Standard improvements): fully - 8, partially - 1, do not comply - 0.

Recommendations for improvement:

3.1.7 – To provide for reflection in the educational journal (Platonus) of all types of resident training: PC, IWRT, IWR, duty.

Standard 4: RESIDENTS

4.1 Admission policy and selection

The procedure for admission and selection to the residency of the NSOC is carried out in accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Supreme Legal Entities: Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/K950001000/links>; Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 27, 2007 No. 319-III "On Education" <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/Z070000319>; Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No RK MOH-270/2020 dated December 15, 2020 "On approval of the rules for placing a state order, admission to training and training of medical personnel in residency" <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/V2000021802>; Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 600 "On approval of the Model rules for admission to training in educational organisations implementing educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education" <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/V1800017650>; Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 27 dated January 30, 2008 "On approval of the lists of clinical specialties for training in internship and residency" (with amendments and additions as of 05/14/2021) <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/V080005134>.

Persons who have mastered the EP of higher education and internship, and have a document with the assignment of the qualification "Doctor" is admitted to the residency of the NSOC.

The experts confirmed that the NSOC implements its admission and selection policy for residency training in alignment with the healthcare priorities of the Republic of Kazakhstan regarding the provision of medical care to the population, while also considering the institution's clinical training capacity, practical learning opportunities, and the availability of educational and material-technical resources.

After reviewing documentation and conducting an interview with the staff of the Education Department, the experts found that applications for residency training are accepted annually from July 3 to July 25. Entrance examinations are held from August 8 to August 16, and admission is finalized before the start of the academic year. Thus, state requirements are met. Admission to residency is based on the decision of the Admissions Committee, which is formalized by an official order of the Chairman of the Board and communicated to the applicants.

Residents confirmed that applicants for the residency programme in "Urology and Andrology adult, children" take an oral entrance examination. The questions for the entrance exam are published on the official NSOC website. Admission to residency is competitive and based on the entrance exam results. An educational service contract is signed between NSOC and the resident.

Admission of applicants with disabilities who require special accommodations is carried out in accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan. However, as the experts understood, in practice, NSOC has not yet admitted any applicants with disabilities requiring special conditions into the residency programme.

4.2 Number of residents

Between 2021 and 2024, a total of 48 residents were admitted to the residency program in the specialty "Urology and Andrology adult, children" (17 in 2021, 13 in 2022, 9 in 2023, and 9 in 2024).

Based on meetings with various categories of stakeholders in the educational process, the experts confirmed that the NSOC trains highly qualified healthcare professionals. Moreover, the Center plans to review the number of residents admitted, based on the allocated state educational order, grants from local executive authorities (Akimats), and applicants on a tuition-paying basis. The institution also intends to expand the geographic diversity of its student body in the future.

Thus, the NSOC carries out admission to residency in line with the country's healthcare workforce needs, current legislation and regulatory legal acts, the available material and technical infrastructure, and the institution's human resource capacity. For example, in the 2024–2025 academic year, the NSOC received a state educational order that enabled the admission of 35 residents, including 9 in the specialty "Urology and Andrology adult, children".

4.3 Support and consulting of residents

The Admissions Committee provides detailed consultations to residency applicants regarding the list of residency programs offered. Information about the residency programs is publicly available on the website (<http://cancercenter.edu/kz>).

Academic advising for residents is provided by specialists from the Education Department throughout the entire period of training. Residents confirmed that they receive consultations regarding the organisation of the educational process (academic calendar, class schedule, Individual Education Plan (IEP), and elective component courses). Each resident is assigned to a clinical department aligned with their specialty, which participates in the implementation of the educational programme, development of the IEP, and provision of clinical, educational, and research activities. Residents reported that they are assigned a clinical mentor during the study of each discipline.

Monitoring and assessment of residents' progress are conducted through satisfaction surveys about the educational process and analysis of residents' academic achievements.

Education Department specialists stated that their responsibilities include analyzing unintentional incidents in areas such as legal protection of residents, transparency of the educational process, personal data protection, and confidentiality principles. Residents confirmed that the Education Department staff remain consistently accessible and are ready to assist or respond via messaging platforms such as WhatsApp and Instagram. Overall, the entire staff adheres to the SOP "Rules for Incident Management and Communication with Patients", approved by Order No. 69-OD of the Chairman of the NSOC Board dated February 16, 2023.

4.4 Representation of residents

The NSOC implements the practice of involving residents in departmental working groups during the development or revision of educational programmes, as well as in the approval of such programs at meetings of the Educational and Methodological Council. Medical residents also participate in case reviews conducted by the Commission for the Study of Lethal Outcomes (CSLO).

Residents are involved in planning the conditions of their training by selecting elective courses (elective component). They have the right to choose disciplines from the Catalog of Elective Disciplines (CED) based on their individual learning needs, thereby taking part in decision-making regarding their professional education and skill development.

Among the developed elective courses are subjects such as Transplantology, Clinical Urodynamics, and Reconstructive and Plastic Urology. This catalog addresses the need to fully develop the professional competencies defined by the State Compulsory Education Standard for higher education and serves as a valuable supplement. The experts noted that the most frequently selected elective course by residents is Transplantology. According to the syllabus of this discipline, it is described as follows: Kidney transplantology refers to the process of replacing a kidney from a living or deceased donor in patients with renal failure, with the aim of restoring the functions normally performed by the human kidney. Currently, the NSOC is a leading institution in Kazakhstan in the field of organ transplantation, including kidney transplantation. Alongside the presence of highly qualified specialists in this field, this area has become a priority for residents who seek advanced training in the subject.

The Education Department conducts surveys among residents to assess their satisfaction with the educational process. For example, urology residents expressed 100% satisfaction with the content of the educational programme, the clinical training site, access to clinical resources, and teaching staff.

Residents are included as members of the Educational and Methodological Council and hold voting rights during discussions, review, and approval of academic matters.

4.5 Working conditions

Training of medical personnel in residency is carried out at the expense of the republican and local budgets, at the expense of the student's own funds, employer funds and other funds not prohibited by the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan. According to the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 7, 2008 No. 116 "Rules for the appointment, payment and amount of state scholarships for students in educational organisations" <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/P080000116> resident physicians studying under the state educational order are paid a scholarship in the established amount - 123,122 tenge.

Resident doctors are awarded a state stipend for the entire period of study, regardless of the results of the midterm assessment during the entire period of study.

Combining study with work (no more than 0.5 rates) in areas of activity close to his future specialty, in his free time from study, is permitted with the consent of the head of the EP and the head of the Department. In the presence of a specialist certificate, residents are allowed to carry out independent medical activities in public and private medical institutions.

In accordance with subparagraph 12 of paragraph 3 of Article 47 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 27, 2007 No. 319-III "On Education" <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/Z070000319> students have the right to incentives and rewards for success in their studies, scientific and creative activities.

The Staffing Schedule has been supplemented from 01.06.2024 and includes 0.5 positions for the position of resident physician. There are no positions in the specialty "Urology and Andrology adult, children". The number of positions in other specialties is 0.5 positions for the position of resident physician: anaesthesiologist 0.5 positions - 1 resident physician; gastroenterologist 0.5 positions - 1 resident physician; haematologist 0.5 positions - 1 resident physician.

Resident doctors are granted annual vacations during the academic year for at least 7 weeks with the retention of their scholarship, with the exception of the graduating class.

Residents with work experience may have an individual training trajectory (with rotation across departments), and the training trajectory is also affected by the choice of an elective discipline.

Educational activities in residency are carried out on the basis of the State Educational Standard of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, educational and methodological documentation in accordance with the training program. Residents' practical activities are carried out under the supervision of clinical mentors supervising doctors in departments, who regulate the workload of residents in departments. Resident training hours are from 8:00 a.m. to 3:00 p.m. Time is allocated for work in the library, participation in lectures, seminars and conferences, for independent work. Thus, the training of residents is not limited to providing medical care during the training process, but also through additional activities provides an opportunity to improve theoretical knowledge and their personal development.

Conclusions of the EEC by criteria. Comply with 20 standards (including 14 basic, 6 improvement standards): fully – 20.

Standard 5: ACADEMIC STAFF

5.1 Admission and selection policy

The teaching staff involved in the implementation of the residency programme “7R01126 - Urology and Andrology adult, children” is presented in the table below, and the data from the self-assessment report was confirmed during the on-site visit to the NSOC:

	Employment Status		Academic Degree		Academic Title
	1,0	0,5	Master's Degree	Doctor of Science	Associate Professor
Full-time (1.0 FTE)	2			1	1
Part-time (0.5 FTE or affiliate)		4	1	1	

In 2024, the number of clinical mentors reached 37, compared to 25 in 2020, marking a 1.5-fold increase. Mentors in 2024 hold various academic degrees, including 5 Candidates of Medical Sciences, 1 PhD, and 7 Master's degree holders. In terms of professional qualifications, 16 mentors hold the highest medical category and 9 hold the first category. For the specialty Urology and Andrology, Adult and Pediatric, there are 4 clinical mentors in 2024, including 1 Doctor of Medical Sciences. During the

meeting with clinical mentors, the experts confirmed that the NSOC ensures a balance between teaching, scientific activity, and the provision of medical care among the engaged faculty. Teaching is carried out in parallel with clinical practice, as residency training requires the integration of theoretical knowledge with practical experience.

Residents confirmed that they are given the opportunity to independently select elective disciplines and form their Individual Educational Plans (IEP). The development of the IEP is carried out by the resident based on the Standard Curriculum and the Catalog of Elective Disciplines, with support from clinical mentors. When designing the IEP, residents also plan their research component (e.g., participation in conferences, publications, etc.).

Clinical mentors in urology — M.N. Asykbaev, D.D. Mustafinov, and Sh.B. Mugalbekov — confirmed that they participated in the training cycle “School of the Clinical Mentor: Current Issues in Postgraduate Education”, which took place from January 24–28, 2022. As a result of these educational activities, all members of the teaching staff underwent training. The Head of the Education Department provided the experts with documentation confirming that, during 2021–2023, with funding from the World Bank Development Project, 6 NSOC specialists completed training in Germany (Charité Clinic), and 14 were trained in South Korea, including 2 faculty members in the field of urology.

While surveying teachers, it was found that the majority (47%) are completely satisfied with the organisation of work and the workplace in this educational organisation, but 32% are partially satisfied. In this educational organisation, teachers have the opportunity to do scientific work and publish the results of R&D - 24% completely agree, 48% partially. Satisfied with the work of the HR service - 56% completely agree, 21% partially. Satisfied with the salary - 44% completely agree, 22% partially.

5.2 Commitments and development of teachers

For the purpose of verifying the data of Standard 5, during the meeting with the Head of the Human Resources Department and interviews with faculty members, the experts obtained insights into the approaches to developing the teaching competencies of instructors, their motivation to work with residents, and the implementation of mentorship. The experts determined that both faculty members and residents have sufficient time for teaching, mentorship, and learning.

When assessing the quality of teaching, the opinion of the residents holds great importance, as it is the learners who experience its impact directly and act as partners with the faculty in the educational process.

At NSOC, monitoring of satisfaction with the quality of educational services is carried out through the collection of resident feedback via the “360-Degree Analysis” survey. The experts reviewed the results of the survey for 2022–2023 during their visit to the Education Department. Positive feedback prevailed in all reports.

However, in the opinion of the experts, it is necessary to increase the academic mobility of faculty to other universities offering residency training, and also to provide for the mobility of clinical mentors.

In the educational organisation, there is an opportunity for career growth and development of the competencies of the teacher - 83% of the surveyed teachers answered, and 17% partially agree with this. Studied in professional development programs - 36% less than 1 year ago, 14% during the current year, 30% more than 3 years ago, 17% more than 5 years ago, and 3% answered "I don't remember when it was."

The organisation implements social support programmes for teachers - 87% answered that "yes, such programmes exist," 64% "I have already used this," 3% of respondents answered that there are no such programmes, and 10% of respondents do not know about this.

Conclusions of the EEC by criteria. Compliant out of 8 standards (including 7 basic, 1 Standard of improvement): fully - 7, partially - 1, do not comply - 0.

Recommendations for improvement:

5.1.1 – To expand the possibilities of internal and external academic mobility of teachers and clinical mentors.

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

6.1 Material and technical support and equipment

The experts visited the multidisciplinary clinic of the NSOC, which includes all clinical areas necessary for training: inpatient care (surgical and therapeutic departments, operating unit, anesthesiology and intensive care department), outpatient clinic, diagnostic departments (radiology, CT/MRI, X-ray department, endoscopy department, ultrasound diagnostics, functional diagnostics), pharmacy, rehabilitation and physiotherapy department. For the programme "Urology and Andrology adult, children" there are 92 inpatient beds and outpatient visits available in polyclinics and medical centers (based on concluded agreements).

The experts confirmed that the training of urologists-andrologists is conducted using modern equipment and software that meets safety standards. Theoretical classes are held in specially equipped classrooms and halls that meet medical standards, while practical sessions take place in clinical departments where students and residents acquire hands-on skills. The following facilities are available for educational activities: a small conference hall with 30 seats, a small room with 12 seats (administrative block), a large conference hall with 90 seats, a lecture hall with 20 seats on the 4th floor, and a study room on the 2nd floor with 10 seats. All conference halls are equipped with necessary tools, including a portable projector and laptop for use in departments, flip charts, and whiteboards.

The experts visited the simulation classroom, which opened in 2019, with an area of 32 m². It is equipped with mannequins for training urologists-andrologists. Residents in the "Urology and Andrology adult, children" educational programme can practice emergency care skills, such as cardiopulmonary resuscitation.

The experts also visited the library, which includes a reading room with 14 seats and 14 internet-connected computers. Specialists from the Education Department and interviewed faculty noted that lectures—including online ones—as well as practical and individual sessions with residents are conducted in the reading room.

The electronic library includes resources from external sources, electronic copies of publications, electronic educational materials authored by NSOC faculty, and printed publications, including those on urology and andrology. The experts determined that the library provides sufficient educational and scientific literature on urology and andrology, and observed the availability of editions published within the past three years. In 2024, 59 books and 23 educational manuals were acquired, taking into account feedback from clinical mentors and residents. Access to international databases is available, and residents are aware of this.

Clinical training agreements have been concluded with three medical organisations in Astana, as well as with three national research institutes and scientific centers, totaling more than 58,000 m² of space and 250 inpatient beds.

Before starting a specific course within the educational programme, residents receive a syllabus from the instructor and are informed about the skills they are expected to acquire and develop during the training period.

6.2 Clinical bases

A review of the resources demonstrated that they are aligned with the goals and objectives of the educational activities. The training of residents is primarily conducted at the institution's own clinical base — the National Scientific Oncology Center (NSOC) with 250 beds. In April 2022, the NSOC was accredited by the Commission of the Public Association "Experts and Consultants on External Comprehensive Evaluation in Healthcare" for a period of three years. The presence of national accreditation indicates that the clinical base and its infrastructure meet modern standards.

Residents specializing in "Urology and Andrology adult, children" also undergo training at other clinical bases in Astana, as listed below:

№	Name of Clinical Base	Legal Address
1	MSE on REM Multidisciplinary City Hospital (MCH) №1	66 Rakhimzhan Koshkarbayev Ave., Astana
2	MSE on REM MCH №2	8 Turar Ryskulov St., Astana

3	National Research Center for Maternal and Child Health	32 Turan Ave., Astana
4	MSE on REM MCH №3	26B A. Moldagulova St., Astana

Two clinical training bases for the specialty 7R01126 “Urology and Andrology adult, children” were visited by the experts. The training is conducted by four full-time faculty members.

The MSE on REM “Oncology Center of Astana” has 30 surgical beds, of which 8 are designated for urology. The Corporate Fund “University Medical Center” provides 20 adult multidisciplinary surgical beds, including 2 adult urology beds and 30 pediatric urology beds. A sufficient number of specialized patients are available, and the facilities are equipped with modern technology and accessible to learners. Faculty members ensure high-quality training while maintaining ethical and deontological standards. NSOC staff foster collegial and ethical relations with the medical personnel and the administration of the clinical bases to achieve the intended learning outcomes for residents.

To validate the information provided in the self-assessment report and to obtain evidence of programme quality, interviews were conducted with residents. Experts asked questions regarding their satisfaction with the training, the adequacy of time allocated for patient management and working with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and faculty qualifications, as well as social and moral support provided to those in need. Questions were also raised about participation in “Journal Clubs” and access to international professional literature databases. Overall, residents expressed satisfaction with the training and assessment methods. They deliberately chose this educational institution, considering its strong resources, reputation, and international connections. At the same time, residents expressed a desire for more independence in patient management and participation in international events.

The residents demonstrated their commitment to the educational institution, actively responded to the external experts’ questions, and shared their views on the training process, skill assessment, advisory support, research involvement, and funding opportunities. The experts reviewed residents’ documentation (portfolios, resident assessment checklists, and survey results).

6.3 Information technology

The experts assessed the access of residents and faculty members to the necessary web resources, including access to the official website <http://cancercenter.kz> — Main Page — About Us section, under “Education”, which is fully available to all interested parties. The informational and educational content is regularly updated. The Center’s IT Department ensures uninterrupted internet service, has developed a local computer system, a video lecture broadcasting system in classrooms, and has implemented distance learning systems (Zoom).

The National Scientific Oncology Center (NSOC) is equipped with information and communication technologies and electronic media tools, including:

1. Documentolog – Electronic document management system
2. Public Storage – A data-sharing server used between departments
3. CMIS – Clinical Medical Information System

The experts confirmed that the NSOC provides learners with access to up-to-date data and literature, as well as access to electronic databases and online libraries, through cooperation agreements with other educational institutions. Residents are confident that they have the opportunity to use library collections, electronic resources, and periodicals in the institution’s computer lab. Various events are also held, such as lectures and seminars with external experts who share the latest data and literature in their fields. All these measures are aimed at ensuring learners have access to relevant and high-quality information, supporting their professional development and enhancing their knowledge.

6.4 Clinical Teams

Residents manage patients under the supervision of a clinical mentor (often the head of the department), participate in surgeries, perform various procedures, and develop their skills using simulation equipment.

Teamwork skills are developed through providing care in emergency situations (e.g., pain syndrome, anaphylactic shock, hemorrhagic shock, seizure syndrome), where effectiveness depends on proper team coordination. In such situations, tasks are performed within one's scope of competence. Additionally, senior-year residents take part in coordinating the work of junior-year residents.

Skills in interdisciplinary team-based learning are actively developed through residents' participation in regular clinical case discussions that involve specialists from various fields and the Academic and Methodological Council (AMC). The experts met with members of the AMC and found that its main tasks include improving the system of clinical training for students at the NSOC, analyzing and reviewing complex clinical cases of scientific, educational, and practical interest, developing proposals for enhancing the medical care system, clinical training, scientific research, and patient safety. The results of the experts' meetings with residents from various specialties — including 8 (out of 9 in 2024) future urologist-andrologists — showed that residents actively participate in the aforementioned educational activities and are informed about their outcomes. Residents participate in clinical consultations and perform tasks assigned by their colleagues within their professional competence. Skills in coordinated work with colleagues and other healthcare professionals are developed during rounds, examinations, treatment, and the provision of emergency care to patients.

Leadership competencies in the learning process are formed by involving senior-year residents in coordinating the work of junior-year residents. Teaching competencies aimed at training other healthcare professionals are developed through the conduct of seminars and practical training sessions for physicians and mid-level medical staff at clinical sites. The topics of these sessions are outlined in the comprehensive clinical base activity plans. Unscheduled training sessions are conducted when there is a need to reinforce specific skills among clinical base staff.

In the questionnaire, residents noted that they have free access to patients at clinical sites and all the conditions for improving their practical skills - 89% of teachers completely agree with this, 11% partially agree.

6.5 Medical scientific research and achievements

The NSOC implements and develops fundamental and applied scientific research in cooperation with leading scientific centers, government bodies of Kazakhstan, and international organisations. In the current year, the following research projects are being carried out: A project funded by the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan (MSHE RK) for young scientists: "Study of *Fusobacterium nucleatum* and its association with colorectal cancer based on modern molecular genetic methods". A scientific and technical programme (STP) on the topic: "Proteolytic processing of TAM receptors: implications for the biology of bladder cancer and use of urine biomarkers".

The planned research projects for 2025–2026 share a common concept: "Development and Implementation of Innovative Technologies for the Treatment of Oncological Diseases" and include:

1. The use of Pressurized Intraperitoneal Aerosol Chemotherapy (PIPAC) in the comprehensive treatment of patients with locally advanced gastric cancer;
2. The use of decellularized bovine peritoneum for breast reconstruction in patients with malignant neoplasms;
3. The application and implementation of innovative Pressurized Intrapleural Hyperthermic Chemotherapy for the treatment of patients with primary and metastatic pleural lesions;
4. The implementation of Chimeric Antigen Receptor T-cell (CAR-T) therapy technology for the treatment of hematologic malignancies into practical healthcare;
5. Integration of epigenetic markers with machine learning to improve epidemiological approaches to the prevention of chronic non-communicable diseases in adults of reproductive age;
6. Development of innovative biomedical technologies to enhance the efficiency of diagnosis and treatment of oncological diseases based on molecular-genetic and cellular markers.

Currently, 9 second- and third-year residents are involved in research projects as part of the residency programme. Urology-andrology residents participate in a research project with Nazarbayev University titled: "TAM receptors as therapeutic targets for bladder cancer treatment: a preclinical study". All research activities are documented in the resident's portfolio.

Interviews with 21 full-time faculty members revealed both achievements and challenges in educational management, which vary depending on the clinical base (e.g., access of residents to equipment, sufficient number of relevant patients, time allocated for medical documentation, and independent work).

76% of surveyed faculty members believe there are sufficient equipment and resources available to train residents within the accredited programme, while 24% partially agree with this statement.

6.6 Expertise in the field of education

The expertise of educational programmes is carried out in three stages.

First, it is conducted by the Department of Education at the document development stage to ensure compliance with the requirements, including the preparation of working curricula and academic programmes, as well as adherence to the structure and volume of all subjects—both core and elective.

Next, the programmes are approved by the Academic and Methodological Council (curricula, continuing professional development programmes by areas and training topics).

The quality of educational programme implementation is evaluated through surveys of residents and employers to assess programme effectiveness and identify strengths and weaknesses in teaching systems and educational content.

Incentivizing the work of instructors and clinical mentors is one of the mechanisms for periodic review, study, and evaluation of the educational programme, which helps ensure the quality of its management. Teachers and mentors receive financial incentives for participation in scientific research and its outcomes (publications, patents, certificates of authorship, monographs, textbooks, implementation acts, etc.). To support this, the NSOC covers all expenses related to the review and publication of instructors' methodological manuals and guidelines. Another form of encouragement is full reimbursement of publication fees by the NSOC for articles in international peer-reviewed journals with high percentiles.

6.7 Training in other institutions

As part of maintaining international cooperation, resident exchange, and sharing of experience in medical education—including conducting training seminars for specialists and residents—memoranda have been signed with foreign clinics: the National Cancer Center of Korea, as well as institutions in Turkey, Israel, Italy, Japan, Denmark, Germany, Russia, France, and the United Kingdom. All information is detailed in the self-assessment report of the educational programme.

In addition, 11 cooperation agreements have been concluded with Kazakhstani organisations:

- 1) NJSC "Astana Medical University" (No. 19-D-418 dated 05/29/2023);
- 2) MSE on the REM "City Polyclinic No. 9" (No. 40 dated 04/19/2023)
- 3) MSE on the REM "Oncology Centre of Astana (07/08/2019)"
- 4) LLP "Green Clinic (No. 1 dated 05/10/2023)"
- 5) MSE on the REM "Multidisciplinary Regional Hospital No. 2" (No. 1 dated 10/05/2020);
- 6) RSE "Hospital of the Medical Centre of the Presidential Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan" (No. 1 dated 15.09.2021)
- 7) Corporate Fund "University Medical Centre" (No. DNIO 1963 dated 18.10.2019)
- 8) LLP "Aesthetic life" (No. 115 dated 20.11.2020)
- 9) LLP "Format" dated 05.02.24,
- 10) LLP "Multidisciplinary Medical Centre "Meyirim" dated 24.10.23
- 11) Research Institute of Traumatology and Orthopaedics named after Academician N.D. Batpenov No. 1 dated 29.08.2024.

Experts familiarized themselves with all agreements during their visit to the Department of Education.

The NSOC implements faculty academic mobility programs and invites visiting professors in accordance with the goals and needs of students and staff, while adhering to ethical principles. The implementation of these programs promotes the internationalization of education and integration into the global educational space, aligning with the NSOC's policy.

Experts reviewed documentation on resident teaching methods and found confirmation of the data from the self-assessment report during interviews with residents and faculty.

Theoretical teaching methods include lectures, seminars, oral presentations, and videoconferences. Interactive teaching methods are used: simulation-based training, brainstorming, group discussion, portfolios, blended assessments, simulation technologies, and presentations. The primary focus is on clinical training (practical skills), including patient management, clinical duty shifts, participation in clinical case discussions and ward rounds with professors and associate professors, participation in surgeries of varying complexity with subsequent reporting at morning conferences, department activity reporting, training sessions with physicians, and practicing skills in simulation labs.

Faculty undergo continuing professional development courses in order to re-certify their specialist qualifications every five years. The NSOC provides 80% of this training.

Training in teaching skills is included in Standard 5. In 2023, two urologists—Sh.B. Mugalbekov and D.D. Mustafinov—completed training on the topic “Clinical Mentor School: Current Issues in Postgraduate Education”.

Thus, the experts concluded that Standard 6 is met across all criteria.

Conclusions of the EEC by criteria. Comply with 18 Standards (including 11 basic, 7 improvement standards): fully - 18.

Standard 7: ASSESSMENT OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME

7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms

Currently, the process of monitoring residency educational programmes is carried out not only within the educational organisation during the training process but also by the authorized body of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Resident physicians undergo an evaluation stage at the National Center for Independent Examination (NCIE), upon successful completion of which residency graduates receive a specialist certificate, granting admission to clinical practice. 100% of the NSOC residency graduates pass the NCIE examination on their first attempt.

Taking into account the resident's prior educational level, the educational programme includes the following components: classroom-based learning, practical training, and independent study.

To monitor the implementation of the educational programme and to address any issues that may arise, NSOC has approved and regularly updates the following documents: educational activities are carried out in accordance with the current legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and internal regulations, including the Academic Policy approved by Order No. 226 dated July 10, 2024; and the Regulation on the Educational and Methodological Council approved by the Order of the Chairperson of the Board No. 124-OD dated July 18, 2019.

Annual reports and results of intermediate assessments are reviewed at the meetings of the Educational and Methodological Council (EMC), based on which conclusions are drawn regarding the formation of residents' competencies.

NSOC conducts monitoring of training processes and outcomes using assessment and measurement tools. These include test questions, clinical case scenarios, examination tickets, open-ended questions, and other materials for final knowledge assessment, aimed at evaluating the theoretical and clinical achievements of the specialists and determining the extent to which their acquired knowledge, skills, and competencies meet the required standards.

Computer-based testing is used to assess the knowledge gained by trainees, improve the quality of advanced training and retraining cycles, and develop the ability to quickly and correctly choose the right answer from multiple options.

NSOC utilizes testing software (easyQuizzy) for conducting examinations, which includes graphical support such as diagrams, charts, schematics, illustrations, etc.

7.2 Feedback from teachers and residents

The Education Department collects feedback from faculty members/mentors and learners of all categories to assess their level of satisfaction with the content of the educational programme and the

organisation of monitoring, using methods such as surveys, direct communication with staff, and appeals to the Head of the Education Department. At the NSOC, there is a “Suggestions and Complaints” box where learners can anonymously leave their proposals, suggestions, and complaints. A survey titled “Resident Physicians’ Satisfaction with the Learning Process” is conducted once a year for all residents, regardless of their year of study. The questionnaire contains 17 core questions assessing residents’ perceptions of the residency program in the following aspects: key evaluation criteria, effectiveness, and satisfaction. The vast majority of respondents (on average 85–90%) positively evaluate the variety and number of patients in clinical departments, and believe that resident physicians are given adequate responsibility and autonomy in making decisions regarding patient management according to their level of training. However, based on the 2022 results, up to 10% of respondents rated the level of support and assistance from physicians as average. When evaluating the level of faculty engagement in the education of resident physicians, 90.1% of respondents responded positively, expressing their satisfaction with the residency program. According to the 2023 survey results, 94% of respondents were satisfied with all aspects of the residency training process at NSOC.

As part of the annual residency program analysis, a “360-Degree Survey” is conducted to evaluate satisfaction with the NSOC residency programmes. Participants include residents, faculty, clinical mentors, patients, and supervising physicians. The analysis shows that faculty members clearly understand the goals and objectives of the residency programme, and most of them find enough time and motivation to effectively train residents. They also provide positive assessments of the availability of educational resources for residents.

Resident surveys generally show that the overwhelming majority positively evaluate the variety and number of patients in clinical departments, the level of responsibility granted in decision-making regarding patient management according to their competence, and the support provided by physicians. A separate survey among urology residents indicates a high level of interaction with clinical mentors, the professionalism of mentors, and adequate autonomy granted for performing procedures and surgeries.

As part of the 360-degree survey conducted in 2023, faculty members were also surveyed. The questionnaire included 11 main questions and three open-ended items, divided into three levels and evaluated using a five-point scale. The analysis revealed that respondents clearly understand the goals and objectives of the residency programme. 87.9% reported that they have sufficient time and motivation to effectively train residents. The results showed that 81.2% of residents demonstrate autonomy, while 18.8% still require supervision when interacting with and consulting patients.

Thus, NSOC has established a feedback system that involves all participants of the educational process.

7.3 Results of residents and graduates

The proportion of residency graduates who passed the final state attestation and received grades of “good” or “excellent” was 100% in both 2022 and 2023.

7.4 Involvement of stakeholders

NSOC actively engages key stakeholders in the monitoring and evaluation of the educational programme, including the following: (1) Since 2018, independent assessment of residents’ knowledge has been conducted by the National Center for Independent Examination; (2) Employers (healthcare institutions under regional health departments of the Republic) contribute to the creation of an effective system for graduate employment and adaptation to the labor market; (3) NSOC provides educational services in specialized disciplines to residents from external organisations, including students and residents of Nazarbayev University and the UMC Corporate Fund; (4) Open Days are held for prospective applicants interested in entering the residency programs at NSOC; (5) Representatives of

professional medical associations organize scientific and practical conferences on current topics in medical education and specialties; (6) Annual seminars and lectures are conducted at universities throughout the country focusing on cancer prevention and early detection; (7) NSOC serves as the national coordinator for oncohematology services and is responsible for training specialists in the field of “Adult Hematology”.

Feedback results and “360-Degree Analysis” outcomes are discussed during Academic and Methodological Council (AMC) meetings, where decisions are made on further corrective actions. The AMC includes department heads, key faculty involved in residency training, resident physicians, and, depending on the meeting agenda, other relevant stakeholders may also be invited. Thus, NSOC ensures maximum transparency and access to residency program evaluation results for all interested parties.

Interviews with three employers were conducted via Zoom and included questions such as: awareness of the university’s mission, participation in mission and strategic plan development, involvement in advisory bodies, satisfaction with residents’ basic knowledge and skills, participation in resident training through mentorship, provision of necessary resources for practical training and development of clinical thinking, challenges in cooperation with departments and universities in general, and the 100% employment rate of residency graduates.

7.5 Procedure for Educational Programme Approval

NSOC has established mechanisms for the approval of educational programmes, which include evaluation at the stages of planning, implementation, outcome analysis, and revision. This allows continuous monitoring of the educational programme execution. The content of the residency working curricula is defined in accordance with the State Compulsory Education Standard and is implemented through the following academic documents: standard curricula (SC), working curricula (WC), and individual learning plans (ILP).

The SC is approved by the authorized healthcare body and defines the workload of each mandatory discipline in credits. The elective component is represented by the total number of elective credits. The WC outlines the list and workload of each mandatory and elective discipline in credits, the sequence of study, types of academic activities, and assessment formats. It is developed annually and approved by the head of NSOC and also serves as the basis for calculating faculty teaching workload. The ILP defines the individual educational trajectory for each learner and is approved by the academic supervisor. In addition to the SC, a catalog of elective disciplines (CED) is developed. The CED is a systematically organized and annotated list of all elective subjects, including their brief descriptions, study objectives, core content, and expected learning outcomes (knowledge, skills, and competencies to be acquired). The CED also specifies prerequisites and postrequisites for each course, ensuring that learners have the opportunity to select elective disciplines aligned with their interests and educational goals.

Thus, the process of approving the residency educational programmes at NSOC complies with national requirements. No deficiencies were identified in this process by external experts.

The internal quality assurance system is coordinated by the Department of Quality Management and Patient Safety (DQMaPS), which is responsible for planning and coordination, improving the management system, enhancing the quality of services provided, and conducting internal audits.

Conclusions of the EEC by criteria. Comply with 10 standards (including 7 basic, 3 Standard improvement): fully – 10.

Standard 8: MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION

8.1 Management

In accordance with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" and other regulatory legal acts governing the activities of higher medical educational institutions, the NSOC has developed and approved documents that define the responsibilities and authorities related to the residency educational programme. These include obligations to ensure the full provision of the educational process with all necessary information resources such as textbooks, teaching aids, methodological manuals and

materials for academic disciplines, active handouts and guidelines for independent work, electronic textbooks, and access to networked educational resources:

- Order of the Chairman of the Board of NSOC "NSOC Academic Policy" No. 226 dated July 10, 2024;

- The procedure for admission to residency is established in accordance with the Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. RK MOH-270/2020 dated December 15, 2020 "On approval of the rules for the placement of the state educational order, admission to education and training of medical personnel in residency" and the SCES RK – 2022 for residency.

For the period 2022–2024, the state educational order amounted to 75 places.

Learners who have completed the residency educational programmes in their specialty and successfully passed the final attestation are awarded a state-recognized certificate of qualification in the respective specialty. According to the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 39 dated January 28, 2015 "On approval of the types and forms of state-recognized educational documents and the rules for their issuance", and in accordance with subparagraph 6-3) of Article 5 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" dated July 27, 2007, a certificate of residency completion is issued. Upon completion of training and successful final attestation, a graduate of the NSOC residency program in the specialty "Urology and Andrology adult, children" is awarded a certificate of residency completion with the qualification of "Urologist and Andrologist, including Pediatric", signed by the chairperson of the attestation commission and the program head. The awarding takes place in a formal ceremony with the participation of NSOC staff (administration, physicians, teaching staff, and residents).

NSOC is undertaking measures to improve the administration and management of the residency program: process optimization, development of procedures and policies for enhancement, allocation of budget funds to support the residency programme, and more.

Transparency in managing the educational programme is ensured through discussions of the educational and methodological documentation of the residency programme at the meetings of the Academic and Methodological Council (AMC), and upon receiving a positive conclusion, it is approved by the program head of NSOC. The AMC includes 11 members representing administrative and managerial staff, managers, medical personnel, and NSOC resident physicians.

The official NSOC website provides information on continuing education programmes: application instructions, class schedules, academic calendar, syllabi, etc., ensuring accessibility and transparency of the educational process.

For rapid communication of useful information to faculty and learners, NSOC uses internal corporate email, a WhatsApp group with all group leaders, and organizes meetings between the leadership and students.

8.2 Academic leadership

In accordance with standard documents, the NSOC has developed and approved regulations for each department, defining the structure, governance, accountability, goals, objectives, and functions of structural units, as well as job descriptions for each position included in the staffing schedule. The governing body of the NSOC is the Management Board, chaired by Burkitbayev Zhandos Konysovich.

The Chairman of the Management Board of NSOC is appointed and dismissed by order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan and bears personal responsibility for financial and economic activities, the safekeeping of NSOC property, the organisation of anti-corruption measures, and defines the responsibilities of Vice-Chairpersons and other key leaders of NSOC. The Chairman independently resolves all issues within the scope of the Center's operations, in accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the NSOC Charter.

Residency-related matters are overseen by the Vice-Chairperson for Research and Educational Activities. The Education Department is responsible for organizing residency programmes. The department is headed by Almira Asetkyzy Zhukubayeva, who is appointed by the NSOC leadership based on the results of an open competition.

The main functions of the Education Department are described in the official regulations, and experts have reviewed the job descriptions of the staff.

The educational process is regulated by the working curriculum for each specialty, the academic calendar, and the Individual Study Plan (ISP) of the resident. The quality of training in clinical departments is monitored systematically by the Education Department.

The NSOC periodically revises and approves the Learning Rules, which clearly outline the rights, responsibilities, and accountability of both students and NSOC administration, as well as the organisation of the educational process. These rules designate responsible staff and their areas of accountability for compliance.

The leadership's performance in fulfilling the mission and addressing the objectives of NSOC is analyzed and evaluated based on reports and planning documents, the Development Concept of NSOC (approved by Order No. 420 of the Minister of Health of the RK dated April 1, 2019), the strategic plan implementation review, internal audit reports (per schedule), and the findings of internal and external reviews.

Current and long-term issues in education, science, and clinical areas are discussed at weekly leadership meetings.

One of the tools ensuring transparency in governance and decision-making related to the educational programme is the Academic and Methodological Council (AMC).

Student learning outcomes are also indicators of effective leadership: final control, interim assessment, and final certification.

Learners can be involved in evaluating the leadership's performance by expressing opinions and feedback at the end of a cycle or course, or through surveys to gather views and consider suggestions and remarks from the direct beneficiaries. Feedback may include comments on the organisation of the learning process, elective courses, the list of electives, the library collection, and other areas directly related to the educational experience.

In response to the survey question, "Do the organisation's leaders listen to your opinion regarding the educational process, research activities, and clinical work?", 100% of faculty members responded affirmatively, stating that their voices are consistently heard.

To the question in the questionnaire "Do the organisation's managers listen to your opinion regarding issues related to the educational process, research, clinical work?", 100% of teachers answered that they do so systematically.

8.3 Budget for training and resource allocation

The work of the financial block is coordinated by the First Deputy Chairman of the Board. The chief accountant heads the accounting department, the chief economist - the economics and finance department. The structure also has a public procurement department.

The Department's activities (*for training employees, purchasing and maintaining educational equipment, mobility of students and teaching staff, etc.*) are financed from its own activities and allocated funds from the republican budget. Budget planning, accounting and financial reporting are carried out in accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan on accounting and financial reporting and accounting policies.

The Financial Service monitors the compliance of the Education Department with the requirements of legislative and other regulatory acts governing its activities; providing the management with objective and timely information on activities to achieve sustainable success, as well as monitoring and control over the elimination of violations identified in the course of performing functions.

While conducting training under additional and non-formal education programs on a contractual basis, contracts are concluded in accordance with current regulatory and legal requirements for state rules for the procurement of services.

The Department monitors and controls the fulfilment of the obligation to train, regardless of the form of training, by concluding a training contract with students and under contractual cycles with medical organisations, in accordance with the Law on Public Procurement.

Financing of the residency program depends on the formation of the annual state order. Every year, the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan approves the state educational order for the training of specialists with higher and postgraduate education, in accordance with which the financing of residency programs by types of educational institutions is determined. In accordance with the methodological recommendations "Planning expenses for the training of personnel with higher and postgraduate medical and pharmaceutical education" by order of the Minister of Health and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 8, 2015, a financial and economic calculation of the cost of training a resident physician is carried out within the framework of the state educational order, rational use of funds allocated from the republican budget for the training of specialists with medical education.

At the expense of the 006 republican budget programme in 2024, 59 titles of books in the amount of 96 pieces were purchased, manuals for the centre's employees for 2021-2024 were prepared and published 23 methodological recommendations and teaching aids, which were examined at the RSE "NSCHD named after Salidat Kairbekova" and the EMA in the direction of training - Healthcare. In total, the library has 173 titles in the amount of 479 books, of which 23 works are authored by doctors of our Centre in the amount of 230 pieces (each book with 10 copies).

8.4 Administration and management

Clinical mentors and subject teachers receive monthly remuneration for their work. Employees who also serve as instructors are provided with financial assistance (through the trade union system), and incentives are offered to encourage research activity among teaching staff (participation in scientific and technical programs, scientific grants). Additional compensation is provided for academic degrees, which contributes to the integration of innovations into the educational process.

According to the minutes of the founding meeting dated June 18, 2019, a primary trade union organisation of the NSOC was registered under the Branch of the Kazakhstan Sectoral Trade Union of Healthcare Workers SENIM in Astana. As of today, the NSOC trade union has over 679 members, accounting for 70% of all employees.

On the initiative of trade union organisations, a Collective Agreement for 2019–2023 was signed on November 4, 2016 (registered on August 26, 2019, with the Employment and Social Protection Department of Astana). Under this agreement, the employer is obligated to adopt internal regulations that include labor law provisions in coordination with the NSOC trade union.

To ensure the quality of educational programmes, the organisation implements evaluation methods to support their development and continuous improvement. These include: Annual performance evaluations of employees at the end of the year, using specially approved evaluation forms with criteria tailored to each position type; Quarterly monitoring by the Educational and Clinical Quality Monitoring Department regarding the Quality Program implementation in the centers, which includes monitoring incidents, complaints, key performance indicators, patient satisfaction, medical chart audits, and compliance with national accreditation standards; Evaluation of the quality of the educational process and student academic achievements.

8.5 Requirements and regulations

The educational organisation complies with the recommendations of national authorized bodies, including the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. In accordance with the residency specialty classifier (approved by Order No. 569 of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 13, 2018, On the Approval of the Classifier of Fields of Training for Higher and Postgraduate Education), as of the beginning of the 2023–2024 academic year, the organisation provides training in 8 residency specialties and plans to offer training in 8 specialties in total.

All educational programmes are supported by the necessary educational and methodological documentation and qualified teaching staff.

Conclusions of the EEC by criteria. Comply with 11 standards (including 8 basic, 3 Standard improvements): fully - 11.

Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

Following the changes to the State Compulsory Education Standard (SCES) of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan in 2020, the curricula for first-year residents were revised. Internal regulatory documents are also being reviewed to align with the newly established requirements.

The primary tool for assessing education quality and monitoring the educational process is the “360 Analysis” instrument, which enables evaluation from a wide range of participants in the educational process (residents, teaching staff, physicians, clinical mentors, patients, etc.). Based on respondents’ comments in the “Open Questions” section, the NSOC identifies the most problematic issues and areas for improvement.

Evaluation and monitoring of the residency educational programme implementation at NSOC also highlighted the need to further develop the teaching potential in the field of educational technologies. As of today, out of 61 residency instructors, 42 (69%) hold certificates of completion of professional development courses on educational technologies, particularly on the topic: “School of Clinical Mentors: Current Issues of Postgraduate Education”. This training has become a regular practice and includes educational programmes in priority clinical areas, as well as regular analysis for the improvement and systematization of the programmes.

The clinical base is undergoing major transformations, with the construction of new buildings for the National Scientific Oncology Center currently in progress. In the new medical-diagnostic building, oncological care will be delivered in accordance with international standards, incorporating: New methods of laboratory and instrumental diagnostics for precancerous and cancerous conditions; New principles and methods of personalized and combined cancer treatment; A multidisciplinary approach to the diagnosis and treatment of cancer patients; Tertiary prevention methods in oncology, including in day hospitals and outpatient centers.

The structure will include a Nuclear Medicine Center, where radionuclide pharmaceutical preparations (RPPs) will be used for diagnostics and treatment.

The Nuclear Medicine Center will perform the following functions: Detection of tumors, metastases, and recurrences; Determination of the extent of tumor progression; Differential diagnosis; Treatment of tumor formations; Evaluation of the effectiveness of antitumor therapy.

In radionuclide diagnostics, single-photon emission computed tomography (SPECT), which detects gamma radiation, and positron emission tomography (PET) scanners will be used. Radioiodine therapy will be the predominant treatment method.

Given that the NSOC plans to engage in research activities and the development of new diagnostic and treatment methods, the establishment of a cyclotron-production complex is envisaged within a public-private partnership project. The cyclotron-production complex will include a cyclotron, a synthesis laboratory, a quality control laboratory, and a packaging unit.

As part of the implementation of the NSOC project, the launch of in-house production of radiopharmaceuticals (RPPs) is planned, based on fluorine-18 (^{18}F), carbon-11 (^{11}C), and gallium-68 (^{68}Ga). This production will include quality control and sterile packaging in hot cells for the manufacturing of ready-to-use RPPs, in compliance with international Good Manufacturing Practice (GMP) standards.

NSOC plans to introduce modern methods of radionuclide therapy, particularly using radioactive iodine and gallium. RPPs for radionuclide therapy may be supplied by the Institute of Nuclear Physics (INP), which has been certified in accordance with GMP standards. This will ensure the availability of essential RPPs for expanding methods of diagnosis and treatment of oncological diseases.

The implementation of the radioembolization method using RPPs is also planned, with the production of the necessary RPPs to be carried out by the INP.

NSOC also intends to introduce proton beam therapy, a highly selective treatment modality that minimizes radiation exposure to healthy organs and tissues. This method will be used for treating: Pediatric tumors of any localization, Advanced forms of oncological diseases such as lung cancer, prostate cancer, cancers of the head and neck, esophageal and liver cancers, lymphomas, and sarcomas.

The integration of proton therapy into Kazakhstan's oncology services is essential for the following reasons: The high prevalence of cancer types that are effectively treated with proton therapy; The high incidence rates of lung, prostate, head and neck, esophageal, and liver cancers, which are highly responsive to proton treatment.

According to 2017 statistics on cancer patients and diseases, the number of new cancer cases by localization (lung, prostate, esophagus, liver, head and neck tumors, lymphoma, sarcoma, pediatric oncology) totaled 26,073 cases. Of these, 15,644 patients (60%) required radiation therapy. Consequently, the number of patients needing proton therapy (10% of those requiring radiation therapy) amounted to 1,564.

With the implementation of proton therapy at NSOC, utilizing two treatment rooms equipped with scanning proton beam technology, the center will have a throughput capacity of up to 800 patients per year. This will reduce Kazakhstan's current need for proton therapy by half and contribute to the development of medical tourism.

The structure of NSOC will include a Radiation Therapy Center equipped with state-of-the-art high-energy linear accelerators.

Additionally, the implementation of new technologies in cancer treatment using lasers (krypton, argon, neodymium, ruby, and carbon dioxide) is planned. Laser therapy will be used for the following purposes: Tumor removal (vaporization), Tumor size reduction, Restoration of patency in hollow organs (e.g., bronchi, intestines), Pain relief through the effect on nerve endings.

Each type of laser has specific properties and will be selected individually depending on the type and stage of the tumor.

Laser therapy will be used for the complete or partial removal of tumors of various localizations. However, it is most frequently planned to be applied in the treatment of the following types of cancer: skin cancer (including all types, such as melanoma), oral cavity cancer, laryngeal cancer, bronchial cancer, esophageal cancer, stomach cancer, intestinal cancer, liver cancer, cervical and vaginal cancer, bladder cancer, and prostate cancer.

Laser therapy is primarily used as a main treatment method in the earliest stages of cancer, mainly for superficially located tumors. In most cases, however, it is combined with chemotherapy, radiotherapy, and biotherapy.

NSOC will implement robotic surgery using robotic systems during operations. Robotic-assisted surgery will be performed using a laparoscopic approach.

For the diagnosis and treatment of malignant neoplasms, NSOC will be equipped with all the necessary therapeutic and diagnostic equipment, including computed tomography (CT), magnetic resonance imaging (MRI), PET/CT, PET/MRI, SPECT/CT, digital X-ray machines, digital mammography units, high-end ultrasound machines, a robotic system for centralized preparation of pharmaceutical drugs, and more.

Conclusions of the EEC by criteria. Compliant out of 2 standards (including 1 basic, 1 improvement Standard): fully – 2.

CONCLUSION: during the external evaluation of the educational programme, it was established that out of 114 standards (including 82 basic standards and 32 improvement standards), 110 standards for accreditation demonstrate full compliance, including 80 basic standards and 29 improvement standards. 2 basic standards and 3 improvement standards are partially fulfilled. No non-compliance with standards was found.

5. Recommendations for improvement of the educational programme "Urology and Andrology adult, children":

1) To include in the budget expenses for conducting internal scientific research with the involvement of residents, as well as for sending to scientific conferences with a report. (1.1.6)

2) While forming the mission and final outcomes of the educational programme, to more actively involve stakeholders in the discussion - residents, teachers, clinical mentors, employers and graduates. (1.4.2)

3) To provide for reflection in the educational journal (Platonus) of all types of resident training: PC, IWRT, IWR, duty. (3.1.7)

4) To expand the possibilities of internal and external academic mobility of teachers and clinical mentors. (5.1.1)

6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The members of the EEC established the compliance of the educational programme of the residency in the specialty 7R01126 "Urology and Andrology adult, children" with the Standards for accreditation and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend that the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit this programme for a period of 5 years.

	Full name	Signature
Chairman	Yesenkulova Saule Askerovna	
International Expert	Rakhmatullaev Akmal Abadbekovich	
Academic Expert	Dzhambulova Bela Telmanovna	
Academic Expert	Iztleuov Yerbolat Maratovich	
Employer Expert	Ospanova Madina Yeralievna	
Student Expert	Aida Kabyldina	

**Профиль качества и критерии внешней оценки образовательной программы резидентуры
«Урология и андрология взрослая, детская» ННОЦ (обобщение)**

Стандарт	Критерии оценки	Количество стандартов	*БС/СУ	Оценка		
				Полностью соответствует	Частично соответствует	Не соответствует
1.	МИССИЯ И КОНЕЧНЫЕ РЕЗУЛЬТАТЫ	14	9/5	9/3	2	
2.	ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНАЯ ПРОГРАММА	22	19/3	19/3		
3.	ОЦЕНКА РЕЗИДЕНТОВ	9	6/3	5/2	2	
4.	РЕЗИДЕНТЫ	20	14/6	14/6		
5.	АКАДЕМИЧЕСКИЙ ШТАТ/ПРЕПОДАВАТЕЛИ	8	7/1	6/1	1	
6.	ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНЫЕ РЕСУРСЫ	18	11/7	11/7		
7.	ОЦЕНКА ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНОЙ ПРОГРАММЫ	10	7/3	7/3		
8.	УПРАВЛЕНИЕ И АДМИНИСТРИРОВАНИЕ	11	8/3	8/3		
9.	НЕПРЕРЫВНОЕ УЛУЧШЕНИЕ	2	1/1	1/1		
	*БС – Базовый Стандарт СУ – Стандарт Улучшения	114	82/32	80/29	5	
		Итого	144	139	5	

Список документов, изученных членами ВЭК в рамках проведения внешней оценки образовательной программы резидентуры

№	Наименования документов/дата утверждения	Количество
1.	Отчет по ОП «Урология и андрология взрослая, детская»	1
2.	Приложение к отчету	1
3.	ОП «Урология и андрология взрослая, детская»	1
4.	Силлабусы	1
5.	Чек листы	1
6.	РУП ОП Урология и андрология взрослая, детская	1
7.	План развития ТОО ННОЦ	1
8.	Правила внутреннего распорядка для обучающихся	1
9.	Договор о совместной деятельности №370	1
10.	Аттестация резидентов 2 года обучения по учебным годам	1
11.	Штатное расписание ППС, обучающихся резидентов по специальности «Урология и андрология взрослая, детская»	1
12.	Список публикации штатных ППС по специальности «Урология и андрология взрослая, детская»	1
13.	Повышение профессиональной и педагогической квалификации штатных преподавателей по специальности «Урология и андрология взрослая, детская»	1
14.	Повышение педагогической квалификации клинических наставников по специальности «Урология и андрология взрослая, детская»	1
15.	Укомплектованность научной и учебной литературы ТОО ННОЦ	1
16.	Список опубликованных работ резидентами по специальности: «Урология и андрология взрослая, детская» за период 2020 по 2023 гг	1
17.	Трудоустройство резидентов по специальности «Урология и андрология взрослая, детская»	1
18.	Сведения о финансировании и основных расходах на обучение (к Стандарту 8 «Управление и администрирование», п.8.3)	1
19.	Академическая политика	1
20.	Состав Ученого совета	1
21.	Кодекс деловой этики	1